

HARROGATE BOROUGH COUNCIL

PLANNING AREA2 DC COMMITTEE – AGENDA ITEM 6: LIST OF PLANS.

DATE: 18 January 2005

PLAN: 10	CASE NUMBER: 04/05282/OUT
	GRID REF: EAST 435018 NORTH 457671
APPLICATION NO. 6.100.2310.B.OUT	DATE MADE VALID: 21.10.2004
	TARGET DATE: 16.12.2004
	WARD: Knaresborough Scriven

Park

APPLICANT: Mr S Peate

AGENT: Mr P Campkin And Associates

PROPOSAL: Outline application for the demolition of existing house and erection of three town houses and one pair of semi detached houses with siting and existing access considered (revised scheme, site area 0.09 ha).

LOCATION: 5 Stockwell Grove Knaresborough North Yorkshire HG5 0LN

REPORT

SITE AND PROPOSAL

Stockwell Grove is a residential street off Boroughbridge Road, Knaresborough. There is a row of shops on the corner of Stockwell Grove with Boroughbridge Road. Next door to this block is a single storey dentists' surgery. The application site is next to this surgery and is occupied by a large detached house. Vehicular access is gained via a drive next the boundary with the surgery. This leads down to a single detached garage at the rear of the site.

There are semi-detached houses opposite and further down Stockwell Grove, with larger detached houses to the rear, on The Avenue, including two more recent ones, 4a and 4b between no.4 and no.6.

It is proposed to demolish the house on site and erect two residential blocks; a pair of semi-detached houses and a block of three townhouses. The application is in outline, with siting and access for consideration at this stage.

The proposed blocks would be built on either side of a new vehicular access. The block of 3 townhouses would be built approximately in line with the neighbouring house at No. 7, and would be about 5m away from this house. The semi-detached houses would be slightly forward of the neighbouring surgery. These houses would be approximately 3.5m away from the surgery.

The proposed access would lead to a turning area between two separate garage blocks.

The side elevations of these garages would back up against the rear boundaries of Nos 2 and 4 The Avenue.

MAIN ISSUES

1. Policy
2. Effect on Streetscene
3. Effect on Neighbours
4. Impact on Trees

RELEVANT SITE HISTORY

6.100.2310.OUT - Outline application for demolition of existing house and erection of three 3-bedroom apartments and six 2-bedroom apartments with siting and access considered (site area 0.09ha). Withdrawn 03.02.2004.

6.100.2310.A.OUT - Outline application for demolition of existing house and erection of 3 no. 3-bedroomed apartments and 6 no. 2-bedroomed apartments with siting and existing access considered (revised scheme, site area 0.09ha). Refused 01.06.2004.

Reasons for refusal:

- 1. The proposed development represents an over-intense use of the site, which would be out of scale with its surroundings and consequently would detract from the character and appearance of the streetscene, contrary to Local Plan Policies HD20 and H6.*
- 2. The parking for the proposed development would, by reason of its proximity and intensity, detract from the residential amenities of neighbours through noise disturbance, contrary to Local Plan Policies HD20 and A1.*
- 3. The proposed building would detract from the residential amenities of adjacent properties through unacceptable overbearing and potential additional overlooking and overshadowing compared to the existing property. This would be contrary to Policies HD20 and A1, and consequently Policy H6, of the adopted Harrogate District Local Plan.*

CONSULTATIONS/NOTIFICATIONS

Parish Council

Knaresborough

Environmental Health

Suggests some acoustic screening between surgery and dwellings.

Yorkshire Water

Recommends conditions re foul and surface water drainage

Chief Engineer (H and T)

1. Drive should be 5.5m wide at back of footway.
2. Amendment required to achieve cycle storage. As gardens would not appear to be large enough to accommodate huts, suggest either increasing garages to 6m long or provide

stand-alone storage similar to bins.

D.L.A.S Arboricultural Officer

See assessment of main issues.

APPLICATION PUBLICITY

SITE NOTICE EXPIRY: 26.11.2004

PRESS NOTICE EXPIRY: 26.11.2004

REPRESENTATIONS

KNARESBOROUGH TOWN COUNCIL - Objects on the following grounds.

The plans supplied have insufficient detail to determine the relationship of the proposed dwellings with existing. The Council is of the view that the proposed dwellings should have the same ridge height as existing 2-storey houses on Stockwell Grove.

OTHER REPRESENTATIONS - 8 letters of objection received, objecting to the proposed development on the following grounds:

- over-intense
- harm to protected tree
- out of scale with surroundings
- loss of residential amenity
- increased traffic
- lack of on-street parking

VOLUNTARY NEIGHBOUR NOTIFICATION - None undertaken.

RELEVANT PLANNING POLICY

PPG1 Planning Policy Guidance 1: General Policy and Principles

PPG3 Planning Policy Guidance 3: Housing

LPH05 Harrogate District Local Plan (2001, as altered 2004) Policy H5: Affordable Housing

LPH06 Harrogate District Local Plan (2001, as altered 2004) Policy H6: Housing developments in the main settlements and villages

LPHX Harrogate District Local Plan (2001, as altered 2004) Policy HX: Managed Housing Site Release

LPHD13 Harrogate District Local Plan (2001, as altered 2004) Policy HD13: Trees and Woodlands

LPHD20 Harrogate District Local Plan (2001, as altered 2004) Policy HD20: Design of New Development and Redevelopment

LPA01 Harrogate District Local Plan (2001, as altered 2004) Policy A1: Impact on the Environment and Amenity

LPR04 Harrogate District Local Plan (2001, as altered 2004) Policy R4: Open Space Requirements for New Residential Development

ASSESSMENT OF MAIN ISSUES

1. POLICY- The site is within the development boundary of Knaresborough, so there is no objection in principle to residential development under Local Plan Policy H6 provided that it complies with other policies of the Plan and is of a scale, density, layout and design appropriate to the area. As less than 10 units are being proposed on previously developed land, there is no objection to development under Policy HX. The site is below the 0.5ha threshold at which the Council would seek to negotiate on affordable housing under Policy H5 of the Selective Alteration.

2. EFFECT ON STREETSCENE - Stockwell Grove is a residential street, characterised by semi-detached houses. The exceptions to this general pattern are the single storey dentists' surgery and the substantial house on the application site. The houses on The Avenue, to the rear of the site, are also quite large, at 3 storeys. The existing house sits within a large site which is set down from the road. This, together with screening provided by trees along the frontage, means it does not appear too prominent in the streetscene.

A previous application here (Ref 6.100.2310.A.OUT) proposed the erection of a single block of 9 apartments across the width of the site. This was refused in June 2004, one of the reasons being that the proposed development would be out of scale with its surroundings, and would detract from the character and appearance of the streetscene.

The development now proposed is for two separate blocks. The applicant has submitted an elevation showing how the two blocks would fit in with their immediate neighbours. The applicant has also submitted photographs showing 2 and 3-storey blocks neighbouring each other elsewhere on Stockwell Grove. These are attached at Appendix 1, together with covering letters from the applicant.

Although two separate blocks are now proposed, it is considered that the proposed development would still tend to dominate the site and its immediate surroundings. The scale of the proposed development remains such that it is considered to be out of keeping with the streetscene and in conflict with Policies H6, HD20 and A1 of the Harrogate District Local Plan.

3. EFFECT ON NEIGHBOURS - The previous application was refused in part because of the impact on residential amenities. One of these reasons related to the noise and disturbance caused by the proximity and intensity of the proposed parking arrangements. While garaging is now proposed, this activity would still take place next to the neighbours' gardens.

Another reason for refusing the previous application was, inter alia, the overbearing impact on No. 7 Stockwell Grove. Although the block of 3 townhouses would be less bulky than the building previously proposed, it would be 2m closer to No. 7. The proposed building would now be about 5m from No. 7, set back about 1m from the front of this house. The proposed block would be about 5m closer to No. 7 than the existing house, and, although it would be the same height, it would have a much greater bulk. It is considered that this overbearing would detract from the residential amenities to an unacceptable degree. This would be contrary to Local Plan Policies HD20 and A1.

The proposed blocks would be over 21m away from the properties on The Avenue. At this

distance, it is considered that the proposed development would not detract from the amenities of neighbours on the Avenue through overlooking, overbearing or loss of light.

4. IMPACT ON TREES - There is good tree coverage to the front of the application site, including conifers which screen the existing house. The Arboricultural Officer has recommended that a silver birch on this frontage should be protected if any development commences.

There is a protected sycamore tree (TPO No 44/2001) in the rear garden of No. 4 The Avenue, and the proposed 3-garage block would be under the canopy of this tree. The Arboricultural Officer has recommended that no construction is deemed acceptable under the canopy of this tree. Any development should be at least 2 metres outside the drip line of the tree, which overhangs the site by about 4 metres. As submitted, the proposed development would therefore conflict with Local Plan Policy HD13.

CONCLUSION While there is no objection in principle to the erection of more than one unit on this site, the proposed scheme is still considered to be too intense. It would detract from the character of the area and impact on neighbours' residential amenities to an unacceptable degree.

CASE OFFICER: Mr M Williams

RECOMMENDATION

That the application be REFUSED. Reason(s) for refusal:-

- 1 The proposed development represents an over-intense use of the site, which would be out of scale with its surroundings and consequently would detract from the character and appearance of the streetscene, contrary to Local Plan Policies HD20, A1 and H6.
- 2 The parking for the proposed development would, by reason of its proximity and intensity, detract from the residential amenities of neighbours through noise disturbance, contrary to Local Plan Policies HD20 and A1.
- 3 The proposed building would detract from the residential amenities of adjacent properties through unacceptable overbearing and potential additional overlooking and overshadowing compared to the existing property. This would be contrary to Policies HD20 and A1, and consequently Policy H6, of the adopted Harrogate District Local Plan.
- 4 The proposed development would cause harm to a protected tree, contrary to Local Plan Policy HD13.

